



■ Article ■

## How Are Migrants Viewed in the Eyes of Employers? Double Exclusion among Immigrants in Taiwan

*Hae Na Kim*

University College of Teacher Education, Klagenfurt, Austria

*Yun Hsiang Hsu*\*

National Central University, Taiwan

*Chih-Yu Chen*

National Chengchi University, Taiwan

*Kuo-Jung Lin*

Chihlee University of Technology, Taiwan

### Abstract

While many countries are open to those born elsewhere being part of their nation, surveys find that this acceptance comes with a certain prerequisite—that it is important to speak the dominant language. This prerequisite has been continuously observed and studied in the field of labor market performance. This study surveys 1,043 employers in Taiwan for their willingness to hire foreign brides from Southeast Asia or Mainland China. The link between the proficiency of the use of language among immigrants and direct job discrimination in Taiwanese workplaces is confirmed. Results show that vocational trainings provided by the government to immigrants are not positively associated with a willingness to hire among employers. Policy recommendations are provided with regard to the establishment of language courses.

■ **Keywords** : immigrant workers, gender, marriage migration, vocational training, Taiwan

---

\* Corresponding Author Yun Hsiang Hsu, National Central University, Taiwan, [yhhsu@cc.ncu.edu.tw](mailto:yhhsu@cc.ncu.edu.tw)

## Introduction

The feminization of migration, accompanied by cross-national marriages, has become a dominant feature when referring to immigrants within East Asian countries (Del Rosario, 1994; Glodava & Onizuka, 1994; Ordonez, 1997; Piper, 1997; Suzuki, 2000). The so-called feminization of migration refers to the increase of female immigrants in migration globalization. Female migration has been steadily increasing since the 1990s, whereas male-dominant migration has long been prevalent. Women from Southeast Asian countries such as Vietnam, the Philippines, China, Indonesia, and Thailand have migrated to Taiwan, Korea, Japan, Singapore, and Hong Kong in pursuit of marriage with the local citizens (Constable, 2005; Piper & Roces, 2003).

Though the phenomenon of “feminization of migration” led by cross-border marriage is not a recent trend, the recruitment and management of these female immigrants in the workplace has not garnered much attention from scholars in recent decades. As women who immigrate for marriage are often depicted as “reproductive workers” who are expected to birth children, scholarly interest has heavily focused on the reproductive role of these women within their families. However, work performed by these immigrants extends beyond reproductive roles. For example, in exploring the role of Vietnamese women in Taiwan, Wang (2007) suggests that many Vietnamese female immigrants were eager to find work, though their job choices are often restricted to childcare, cooking, and laundry (Wang, 2007).

Further, Lan (2008) points out that the demand for care-related labor was extensively raised in the 1980s due to the increase of dual-income families as the result of industrialization processes. Responding to the shortage of care-related labor, female immigrants have been placed into the traditional role of women, which Taiwanese women had begun to resist. These “marriage immigrants” thus have been considered to replace the traditionally unpaid reproductive work of women in their new host countries (Kojima, 2001; Seol, Kim et al., 2005; Wang, 2001).

While previous studies have largely explored employers' attitudes and the employment issues faced by female immigrants, little attention has been paid to the employment of female immigrants in Taiwan. Instead, many studies have focused on issues found in North America, Australia, and Europe. Therefore, more contextualized studies regarding social discrimination, equality, and the perspective of employers in Taiwan is needed.

This paper focuses on female marriage immigrants as job seekers beyond the reproductive role imposed by family members in Taiwan. To understand the recruitment and management of female marriage immigrants, this study intends to identify the factors that influence immigrant employment by analyzing employers' attitudes toward immigrants. An employer's decision to hire female marriage immigrants can depend more on the woman's fluency of the host language and the importance of ethnic groups as social capital than on any vocational training program, which has been discussed previously. This study aims to provide policy recommendations based on the results of this research.

## **The Trends and Situation of Transnational Marriage in Taiwan**

Many people are crossing borders due to less expensive transportation costs, faster travel times, and the introduction of new, inexpensive opportunities for networking across borders. Immigrants and other relevant social actors are now better connected. The inflow of "foreign brides" to developed countries has led to the phenomenon of the feminization of migration. The increase of foreign brides is closely related to the change of the host women's status in recipient countries. For example, Lin and Cheng (2013) illustrates that Taiwanese women had greater access to education and were more independent financially. Conversely, with the liberalization of the Taiwanese economy, men working in primary and secondary industries expected low incomes, which weakened their social and economic statuses. A creed of the man marries down, the woman marries up, which is shaped by the patriarchal culture

of East Asian countries, leads men in developed countries to seek marriage partners originating from developing countries (Hsia, 2002). Therefore, international marriage has become a profitable business item for transnational marriage brokers.

According to Lin (2018), the rate of transnational marriages in Taiwan peaked in 2003–2004 and has decreased nearly every year since. While the Taiwanese government's strict migration policy is the main reason for this decrease of transnational marriages, numerous women from developing countries have still managed to cross the country's border for marriage. These women have come to Taiwan for a better life—a decision that was strongly influenced by the experiences of other women with foreign spouses and the mass media's depiction of life and intimate relationships in Taiwan.

In analyzing the feminization of migration, the study of Piper and Roces (2003) is noteworthy. They criticize existing studies for overlooking the various ways to understand the experience of female immigrants in their host country. According to Piper and Roces (2003), employment and marriage are intertwined within the experiences of female immigrants. Women who immigrated for a job had the option to marry men from their host countries. Likewise, women who marry men from their host country also have the option to find a job. However, most women who immigrate for marriage have economically disadvantaged husbands (National Immigration Agency, 2011); consequently, many female marriage immigrants actively seek work outside the home. Piper and Roces (2003) thus emphasize that previous studies focusing solely on either marriage or employment are insufficient for explaining the experience of female immigrants and that we need to consider how the interrelationship between employment and marriage affects their experiences in the host countries.

Some studies do promote the employment of immigrants, which gives us an idea of how to increase the employment rates of female marriage immigrants. First, encouraging immigrants to participate in vocational training programs has become an important vocational training

policy for many host countries (Park, 2011). According to Wu (2015), immigrants in a new country are affected by their prior socialization and socio-cultural experiences from their natal country. Thus, when delivering vocational training to immigrants, culturally responsive pedagogy is extremely important and vocational training instructors need both to have cultural self-awareness and to actively reflect on their training practices. These vocational training programs have the potential to increase the employment rates of female marriage immigrants. However, some studies have criticized vocational training programs specifically designed for female immigrants as being too similar to those for general Taiwanese trainees. These studies claim that the content and methods of vocational training programs should depend on the culture of the attendees (Wu, 2015). Vocational training organizations should provide programs in a culturally meaningful way so as to meet the diversified needs of immigrant trainees, improve training effectiveness, and further empower the trainees. For female marriage immigrants, finding employment and providing financial support for their families are assumed to be responsibilities related to being a “good daughter” or “good wife.” Therefore, vocational training is not only intended to empower spouses as a new labor source in Taiwan, but also to strengthen spouses’ economic standing.

### **Employment, Language, and Transnational Marriage in Taiwan**

Surveys find that the acceptance into jobs comes with a certain prerequisite—that it is very important for immigrants to speak the dominant language of their host country (Pew Research Center, 2017). Only when immigrants efficiently speak the local language can they fully integrate into their new communities. This prerequisite has been well-studied in the field of labor market performance and social integration among immigrants (Blake, Kneebone, & McLeod, 2017; Delander, Hammarstedt, Månsson, & Nyberg, 2005). Numerous language programs have been designed based on these findings; however, integration often fails, and alien-

ation continues to exist in the host communities. Large numbers of the alienated population do not speak their new language fluently, which leads to the continuous unemployment of these immigrants. It seems that language does play an important role when seeking employment, though it is unclear how language proficiency is related to such immigrants' employability.

There are different viewpoints regarding the state of employment for immigrants. Some researchers argue that the employer mentality and biased social attitudes or stereotypes toward immigrants are influential factors affecting immigrants' underemployment (Dietz, 2010; Hsu & Zho, 2007). Another problem is that the employment of immigrants is restricted to specific industries. Borjas (1994, 2006) suggests that social networks among immigrants could broaden their accessibility to specific occupations. With the help of a social network, it is easier to locate other immigrants in certain trades or industries. For an example, the overrepresentation of Mexican immigrants is found in seasonal and temporary agriculture work or catering work in the United States. These jobs are more easily accessed by immigrants through ethnic social networks, and thus act as entry points to immigrant life within their new home country. Further, some experts argue that the use of social networks could be a means for employers to secure their labor supply (Lin & Cheng, 2013). These viewpoints indicate that more empirical evidence is needed if we want to propose an effective employment strategy for immigrants.

According to Lin & Cheng (2013), immigrant workers must work long hours to earn enough to live off of their low wages. In Taiwan, immigrant workers tend to work longer hours than their Taiwanese counterparts yet receive lower salaries. In 2012, immigrant workers earned only 56.55 percent of the average regular wage of Taiwanese workers. However, the injury rate of foreign workers was 1.26 times higher than that of Taiwanese workers as a whole; this was caused by linguistic barriers, cultural differences, and a lack of proper training (Chinese National Federation of Industries, 2011). Overall, immigrant workers face poor

working conditions, long working hours, and low wages in Taiwan while also becoming quite vulnerable to industrial hazards and numerous health problems. Moreover, they face various issues based on gender, nationality, ethnicity, and class biases.

## Methodology

In this study, we adopt a mixed method that combines quantitative and qualitative approaches to data collection and analysis (Creswell, 2012; Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003). Our research design is divided: Two logistic regression models are applied to locate the determinants, and text analysis is used to examine explanations from employers regarding their choices. Two logistic regression models are used to identify the influential factors, and text analysis is further used to analyze our research. We chose this method as our research questions require information from both the macro and individual levels. This mixed-method approach allows researchers to simultaneously collect unbiased data from employers at the macro level through sampling and assess their attitudes at the individual level. We used a semi-structured questionnaire with open-ended questions to document employers' responses.

We surveyed employers in Taiwan and asked those employers who replied whether they were willing or not willing to hire immigrants to provide a brief statement explaining their response. The majority of the employers in this survey had either never hired female marriage immigrants or reported that they usually find and hire female marriage immigrants through diverse routes including through the arrangement of governmental agencies or through introductions from current employees. To better understand the perspectives of the employers in Taiwan, we propose two research questions: First, what are their reasons for not wanting to hire immigrants? Second, if they do hire or have hired immigrants, what were their considerations before hiring, and through what method did they hire these immigrant employees? The original responses from employers was recorded in Chinese, then the researchers

of this study translated the responses into English to proceed with later analysis.

With the use of further text analysis, we have attempted to explain our findings regarding participating employers who have no history of hiring immigrants, noting that there is a mismatch between labor supply and demand in which employers prefer hiring domestic employees over immigrants. It is obvious that an employer's preference for domestic employees eventually leads to the employment of a domestic workforce rather than an immigrant workforce. Therefore, we focus on those employers willing to hire marriage immigrants and will explore the perspectives of these employers further.

Prior studies have focused on the importance of social capital in allowing immigrants to leverage resources in their host country. In general, "social capital" refers to a social network formed by the relationships of individuals. Social capital characterizes norms of trust and reciprocity and produces outcomes of mutual benefit (Bourdieu, 1993; Coleman, 1988). Immigrants benefit from their social capital by receiving useful information about the labor market in their host country (Aguilera & Massey, 2003). A social network provides them opportunities in the labor market and aids them in garnering information about current or future available jobs through "word-of-mouth or other informal channels" (Calvo-Armengol & Zenou, 2005). Moreover, those who are better connected to a larger or a higher-quality social network are more likely to earn a higher income than those who have a limited network (Piracha, Tani, & Vaira-Lucero, 2013).

We had one open-ended question seeking commentary on hiring issues and set up Likert-type scale items geared toward employers who have no history of hiring immigrants in their small, medium-sized, and family-oriented businesses in order to evaluate why they have less interest in hiring female marriage immigrants. In addition, a logistic regression model and text analysis were used to search for research questions. Emphasizing the importance of social capital, we examine factors to determine employers' decisions on whether to hire immigrants.



## Descriptive Statistics

The immigrants in this case study mostly came through cross-border marriages between Taiwanese natives and Southeastern Asian or Mainland Chinese immigrants. Consequently, these marriages brought a massive inflow of foreign population—predominantly female—to Taiwan. These newcomers are often eager to join the labor market because their spouses more often than not possess a disadvantaged or low-income status. However, opportunities for female marriage immigrants to get a job is low. Surveys conducted by the National Immigration Agency (2003, 2008, 2013) in Taiwan show that the unemployment rate of these newcomers is much higher than the average rate of unemployment in Taiwan, which means a considerable proportion of the foreign population cannot find a job.

## Sample

The number of valid samples in this study is 1,083. The majority of the employers (94.2%) who responded to the survey indicated that they currently do not or have not hired immigrants (Table 1). Of the small percentage of employers who hire or have hired immigrants, 13.7% work in hotels and catering, 13.3% in support services, and 11.9% in the education service industry; these three groups of employers constitute 30% of the total employment opportunities for immigrants in Taiwan. In regard to company size, the proportion of employers who hire or have hired immigrants seems to positively correlate with the number of the employees in the company, as the number increases from 2.9% to 28.1% in the company size. However, the difference is not significant from a statistical point of view.

Table 1.

*Descriptive Statistics*

*Unit: persons, %*

Items	Sample	Percentage	Percentage of em- ployers who have hired immigrants	Percentage of em- ployers who have not hired immigrants
<b>Total</b>	1,083	100.0	5.8	94.2
<b>Industry</b>				
Manufacture	142	100.0	7.3	92.7
Construction	77	100.0	3.8	96.2
Wholesale and retail	457	100.0	6.0	94.0
Transportation and warehouse	50	100.0	-	100.0
Hotels and catering	103	100.0	13.7	86.3
Information and communication	12	100.0	-	100.0
Finance and insurance	12	100.0	-	100.0
Real estate	18	100.0	5.4	94.6
Professional, scientific, and technical services	44	100.0	-	100.0
Support services	20	100.0	13.3	86.7
Education service	16	100.0	11.9	88.1
Health care and social work	27	100.0	1.4	98.6
Arts, entertainment, and recreation services	15	100.0	-	100.0
Other services	86	100.0	0.8	99.2
Other industries	5	100.0	19.4	80.6
<b>Company size</b>				
Less than five	852	100.0	2.9	97.1
5-9 people	133	100.0	11.6	88.4
10-29 people	73	100.0	20.9	79.1
Above 30 people	26	100.0	28.1	71.9
<b>Year of establishment</b>				
Before 1987	235	100.0	5.0	95.0
Between 1988-2009	671	100.0	6.5	93.5
After 2010	133	100.0	2.9	97.1
Unknown/refuse to answer	45	100.0	7.3	92.7
<b>Geographic location</b>				
Northern region	409	100.0	5.8	94.2
Central region	316	100.0	5.7	94.3
Southern region	267	100.0	5.7	94.3
Eastern region	85	100.0	5.7	94.3
Outlying Islands	6	100.0	11.6	88.4

## Results

In analyzing our data, we find that vocational training provided by the government is not positively associated with employers' willingness to hire immigrants. This means that policy implications from this research are to strengthen the job matching process and cooperation between employers and these female newcomers through the establishment of an active job-search platform. Another finding is that language often becomes an excuse justifying an employer's choice not to hire immigrants. For those employers who hire or have hired immigrants, we also find that the probability of hiring increases when immigrants have taken a class in their host language. Our last finding is that the social co-construction of the connotation of ethnic capital is necessary to change an employer's point of view on female marriage immigrants from "others" to "us."

### Determinants for Not Hiring

For the first logistic regression model (Table 2), the  $R^2$  is 0.2495. The odds of employers who do not or have not hired immigrants increases and has a statistical significance in our survey when "Not vacancy" and "No immigrants come to the interview" options are presented. This study also converts the value of  $e^B$ . After this conversion, we find that the probability of those employers who do not or have not hired immigrants increases by 26% and 19%, respectively, when employers respond with "Not vacancy" and "No immigrants come to the interview."

This study further examines the respondents' explanations of these two options and finds that the former is related to the characteristics of the company and the latter to labor demand. The latter reflects a job profession that is established by job barriers or one that does not find the new residents suitable for occupation. In other words, for small-sized, medium-sized, and family-oriented businesses in Taiwan, and for the development of new functions of previously established stereotypes, a con-

Table 2.  
*Logistic Regression Model for the Employers not Hiring (n = 986)/hiring (n = 98) immigrants*

Predictors	Not hiring			Hiring		
	<i>B</i>	<i>SE B</i>	<i>e<sup>β</sup></i>	<i>B</i>	<i>SE B</i>	<i>e<sup>β</sup></i>
<b>Not hiring</b>						
Company size	-.0000***	.0001	.9995			
Immigrant’s accent	.1000**	.0295	1.1023			
Immigrant’ experience	.1400***	.0225	1.1464			
Immigrant’s literacy	.0439	.0319	1.0449			
Identity card	.0825*	.0362	1.0860			
Government subsidy	-.0410	.0818	.9598			
Family	-.0093	.0602	.9907			
No vacancy	.2311***	.0166	1.26			
Diploma	.0535	.0447	1.0550			
Certificate	.0869**	.0297	1.0907			
Driving license	.0483	.0432	1.0495			
Computer skills	.0501	.0373	1.0514			
Reference	.0571	.0457	1.0587			
No immigrants come to the interview	.1760***	.0190	1.1924			
Immigrant’s willingness to Work overtime	.0435	.0716	1.0445			
Work permission	.1158*	.0582	1.1228			
<b>Hiring</b>						
Company size				.0002**	.0001	1.0002
Working experience				.7198***	.0473	2.0541
Identity card				.3316***	.0724	1.3933
Government subsidy				.9680***	.1225	2.6328
Job vacancy				.7738***	.0291	2.1680
Impression				.6878***	.0460	1.9893
Education diploma				--	--	--
Certificate				-.6336***	.1705	0.5307
Vocational training				-1.0794***	.1563	0.3398
Chinese language class				1.2702***	.1564	3.5615
Constant	.7246			.0309		
<i>R</i> <sup>2</sup>	.2495			.6359		
<i>F</i>	22.15			208.21		
<i>Df</i>	16			9		

\**p* < .05. \*\**p* < .01. \*\*\**p* < .001.

siderable barrier affects hiring opportunities for foreign and mainland spouses.

This study found that new residents were treated by Taiwanese employers as “others” and were assumed to only be able to play a role

in filling up a workplace. If Taiwan's unemployment rate is reduced, mainland or foreign spouses are hired. According to Wang Hongren (2001), the so-called new residents can only be used as a "complementary labor force," with the understanding that foreign and mainland spouses become an employer's secondary choice when Taiwanese workers are found lacking.

How do employers distinguish between "others" and "us"? What are the benefits of this classification? In employers' responses to other survey options, we found that "language" is one reason employers often use to distinguish between ideas of us and others as well as being used as their rationale for hiring their "own" people. An employer said, "speaking Chinese fluently with our customers is very important," "the understanding of the Chinese language is critical," and "employment opportunities are preferably given to Taiwanese people." He regarded language ability as an effective screening tool and wanted to collaborate with workers who have good language communication skills. In particular, "spoken ability" is the most important factor for employers. This study further discovered that the purpose of distinguishing "others" from "us" is to rationalize discrimination on the basis of language.

However, language is a type of human capital that can be strengthened through education or training. Language can be a critical element that impacts employment, but some employers revealed that "if a foreign or continental spouse could communicate well in the client's language," most employers "did not want to hire them (new residents) unless they were referred by employees (their own people)." So "unless the foreign or mainland spouse is the boss's friend or relative, the company will not hire new residents." This indicates that new residents can only obtain employment if they can communicate with clients fluently and if they have personal connections to the employer. In other words, ability of communication and connection determine employment opportunities.

Table 3.  
Correlation Table for Non-Hiring Immigrants (obs=1057)

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17
Company vacancy	1																
Company size	-0.2249	1															
Immigrant's accent	0.0927	-0.0367	1														
Immigrant's experience	0.1377	-0.0387	0.0641	1													
Immigrant's literacy	0.0939	-0.0341	0.295	0.1335	1												
Immigrant's identity card	0.0719	-0.0204	0.0728	-0.0199	0.055	1											
Immigrant's funding from the government	0.0303	-0.0106	0.0425	0.0101	0.0414	0.1109	1										
Family	0.0441	-0.0199	0.057	0.0292	-0.0421	0.1524	0.1264	1									
No vacancy in the company	0.2705	-0.079	-0.0969	-0.2214	-0.1289	-0.0346	-0.0052	-0.0265	1								
Education attainment of immigrant	0.059	-0.0101	0.0566	0.1384	0.2399	0.0036	-0.0182	0.0104	-0.1108	1							
Skill certificate of immigrant	0.0961	-0.0254	0.0307	0.34	0.0763	0.0358	0.0738	0.0764	-0.1577	0.1782	1						
Driving license of immigrant	0.0614	-0.02	0.0682	0.1135	0.191	0.0901	0.0323	0.15	-0.0897	0.044	0.1846	1					
Computer skill of immigrant	0.0766	-0.0194	0.0604	0.1213	0.3644	0.0176	0.102	0.0818	-0.1459	0.2627	0.111	0.2495	1				
Immigrant's reference by others	0.0556	-0.0161	0.0069	-0.034	0.0448	0.1815	0.0952	0.053	-0.0334	-0.0333	-0.0543	-0.0062	0.0033	1			
Not showing up for the interview	0.1687	-0.0432	-0.0124	-0.0377	0.0244	-0.0114	0.0406	0.0207	-0.2178	-0.0037	-0.0621	-0.0349	0.0798	0.1107	1		
Immigrant's willing to work overtime	0.0359	-0.0135	-0.0037	0.0386	-0.0045	0.0489	0.1599	0.2803	-0.0491	-0.0215	0.0816	0.151	0.0784	0.1224	0.0364	1	
Immigrant's job approval acquirement	0.043	-0.0043	-0.0153	0.0329	0.0089	0.0946	0.0585	0.2294	-0.0628	0.0497	0.0559	0.0459	0.026	0.0156	-0.0245	0.045	1

### Determinants for Hire

This study further analyzed the decisive factors in hiring new residents with a second logistic regression model. Because our dependent variables (i.e., an employer’s willingness to hire/not to hire) are dichotomous, this research implemented LOGIT and PROBIT models. In particular, our independent variables include an immigrant’s language ability and educational level, which are predicted by our theory to be influential factors.

This study found that, with Chinese language courses and the government subsidizing foreign and mainland spouses, the possibility of employment for female marriage immigrants is significantly higher. especially the former than those who have not been at a rate of 2.56 times higher; but they also have the characteristics of human capital investment. The “vocational training” B value is negative. The value of 0.3398, can be interpreted as the possibility of a reduction of about 60% (1-0.3398) with

vocational training but reduces the possibility of employment. The above three variables have statistical significance. This study examines another similar variable, “license,” which can demonstrate one’s ability to work. It shows a negative value of 0.5307—the same value related to a reduction in the possibility of hiring. The significant impact of the Chinese language class further confirms that some employers have hired female immigrants who do not lack skills. This contrasts with findings from previous studies that have solely highlighted the importance of vocational training over language-oriented training.

In regard to the aforementioned social network or social causal factors, it is unclear whether they have an effective impact on foreign or mainland spouses. The majority of successful hiring methods for female immigrants came from introductions by friends and relatives or through other colleagues already working within a company. In further using text analysis to establish a specific image of this pipeline, this study found that the perspectives of employers who did or did not hire female marriage immigrants differ considerably, as the former regards those newcomers as “us” due to introduction from internal staff, while the latter considers foreign and mainland spouses as “them” or “others.”

Furthermore, an employer explained the reason why he preferred personal references: Personally referred employees can be helpful in building and enhancing a better atmosphere in his company.

Because these two are spouses of employees in our company, they are regarded as employees who were “referred by friends and relatives!” I myself prefer this way of hiring, because the job seekers are referred by our own employees, and as the introducer will not want to refer bad employees to me, the job seeker comes with a certain guarantee. And in our company, we like family, so I hope to hire such employees.

This study further found that when new residents have the opportunity to enter the local job market, even if with only a weak social

link, this link may still have a relatively strong bridging effect. Two respondents talked about their hiring experiences and depicted how new immigrants entered the company in the same way.

I still prefer to hire people who are referred by “friends and relatives.” The Vietnamese spouse is referred by a Taiwanese employee in our company because they all live in the same community and they know that their neighbors have foreign spouses and need to work with family. Once the Vietnamese spouse learns that our company needs more manpower, I ask that they recommend other Vietnamese spouses that they know! If the store has no foreign spouses, there is no chance to refer job opportunities to one another.

The first Vietnamese foreign spouse in our company was set up by a reference from a nearby industry. We saw her experience, positive attitude, and willingness to cooperate and decided to hire her. Other Vietnamese spouses then rely on her pulling them into the “referred by friends and relatives” category! When the Vietnamese spouse left, the mainland spouse was introduced. This can be considered “referral by friends and relatives.”

Although people from the same ethnic group may only have weak relationship ties, it is possible for foreign spouses to take part in the workplace by being “pulled in” from other immigrants. In other words, the social capital factors of ethnic capital lead foreign and mainland spouses to specific employment opportunities that may be related to the business subject and may also be promoted through the community. Mainstream groups have significantly different employment opportunities to contact this pipeline, resulting in differences in employment results. This social capital allows employers to consider the applicant’s level of education and technology, and thus affect the employment patterns of new residents, which will be the main impact of ethnic capital in China’s



major employment hiring practices. From Table 4, it is clear that the level of competency, as demonstrated through skill certificates or working experiences, serve as important independent variables to influence the hiring of immigrants in Taiwan.

Table 4.  
Correlation Table for Hiring Immigrants (obs=1083)

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Hiring	1									
Company size	0.2249	1								
Work experience	0.3778	0.0835	1							
Immigrant's identity card	0.275	0.1472	0.1743	1						
Immigrant funding by government	0.1371	-0.0046	-0.0051	-0.0037	1					
Vacancy in company	0.6638	0.2936	0.1733	0.1982	-0.009	1				
Impression toward immigrant	0.3904	0.0606	0.051	0.1682	-0.0053	0.2046	1			
Education attainment of immigrant										
Skill certificate of immigrant	0.1371	0.2036	0.1789	0.2474	-0.0019	0.2066	0.173	0.4991	1	
Chinese language class	0.1371	-0.0005	-0.0051	0.2474	-0.0019	0.0988	-0.0053	0.4991	0.4991	1

### Conclusion

This paper attempts to outline the image of this ethnic capital from the perspective of employers and provide policy advice from a substantive level. The results of the questionnaire survey found that most employers did not employ new residents based solely upon experience and that the employers who did employ immigrants were highly concentrated in specific industries such as accommodation and catering. Further analysis of the influencing factors found that China's small-sized, medium-sized, and family-based employment structure can encourage the belief in stereotypes of occupations for many foreign and mainland spouse employees. The results of this study align with the study of Wu (2019), as they highlight the importance of employers' attitudes about female migrants' employment in Taiwan as well as the importance of their skills training.

Under such structural factors, the employer tends to identify these new inhabitants as "others" or outsiders who compete with their own limited employment opportunities. "Language" is a powerful tool to support employers' decision making, and new immigrants' lack of language

abilities becomes a reason for employers to support the non-employment of immigrants; conversely, if foreign and mainland spouses have taken Chinese courses, the courses become the main determining factor in their employability. However, language ability is not the only factor affecting the hiring of immigrant workers. In addition to language ability, the community established by the social bond of marriage brings the new residents onto the radar of the employer's own people, so employers are more willing to provide the immigrant with opportunities. These two factors, that is, language and social co-construction of the connotation of China's ethnic capital, thus become relevant points of policy.

Considering restrictions on the employment structure faced by female marriage immigrants, "micro-entrepreneurship" may be a rational choice, as suggested by the literature (Lin & Pan, 2016). As employment opportunities in Taiwan are mainly provided by small-sized, medium-sized, and family enterprises, employment directly affects the interests of local people. Thus, employment should not only meet the purpose of improving the family economy, but it can also transform the role of new residents as they are not equal in terms of power. However, the risk of entrepreneurship and the source of funds could be major limiting factors. Furthermore, on the normative basis, Article 5, Paragraph 1 of the Employment Services Act prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, and we cannot shy away from the differential treatment that is still essentially present in society; on the positive side, diversity is also an important factor in improving productivity, and advanced countries are committed to promoting employment equality among ethnic groups through legislation or administration. Finally, from the perspective of social inclusion, attempts to allow new residents to participate fully in the community through employment and living lives with interdependence, such interactions are particularly important for the next generation, which also means that employment will continue to be an important issue that needs improvement to help immigrants.

Based on the results of this study, we recommend that the Taiwanese government adopt a more comprehensive and Active Labor Market Policy

(ALMP) for female marriage immigrants to promote their full employment from three opportunities: job creation, value-added vocational training, and employment services. Additionally, there is a need to provide incentives for companies to create job opportunities. Governmental subsidies for companies may increase their willingness to hire marriage immigrants.

The results of this survey show that institutions are willing to employ foreign and mainland spouses when the government provides subsidies. Therefore, the Ministry of Labor's "Employment Insurance for Employment Practices—Employing Rewards" should include the provision of subsidies. In addition, there is a strong need for value-added vocational training programs for female marriage immigrants with an emphasis on language courses. Host countries should provide necessary training courses through public vocational training institutions along with a cost-of-living subsidy. The results of the survey show that the possibility of employment promotion is significantly higher than that of Chinese people and Chinese spouses through "Chinese courses" and "government grants." When planning a foreign or mainland spouse job enhancement course, the government should provide additional language courses to make it easier for new residents to integrate into Taiwanese work culture and to seek employment. In other words, the Foreign Spouse Care Counseling Fund or the Ministry of Labor should consider incorporating language courses when subsidizing skills training.

Specific measures for employment services could include general employment information, job consultation, and job search skills training. Currently, employment information is not extensive, and institutions that employ foreign or mainland spouse face hiring obstacles. There is a need to maintain one's main channel through the newspaper or interpersonal networks, and new residents can use this platform. From the results of the questionnaire survey and interviews, it is easy to find employers' preferences: They want to find new employees through references by current employees. Through references by others in the group, female marriage immigrants can be entrusted with employment and job search

skills training, and can thus be more successful in Taiwan.

Once employers' attitudes toward immigrants are changed, immigrants will easily be able to join the labor market of the host country. Future research should consider the impact of social and personal factors among marriage immigrants in Taiwan (Ren, Zhang, & Hennessy, 2018). Furthermore, comparative studies with other countries' employers' attitudes toward marriage immigrants will be valuable to provide more in-depth insights for Taiwan. As other Asian countries such as South Korea have faced similar issues, comparative studies will be useful for understanding employers' decisions and for establishing immigration policies in Asian countries.

## References

- Aguilera, M. B., & Massey, D. S. (2003). Social capital and the wages of Mexican migrants: New hypotheses and tests. *Social Forces*, 82(2), 671-701.
- Blake, H. L., Kneebone, L. B., & McLeod, S. (2017). The impact of oral English proficiency on humanitarian migrants' experiences of settling in Australia. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 22(6), 1-17.
- Borjas, G. J. (1994). *Ethnicity, neighborhoods, and human capital externalities* (National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper No. 4912). Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w4912>
- Borjas, G. J. (2006). *Making it in America: Social mobility in the immigrant population* (National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper No. 12088). Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w12088>
- Bourdieu, P. (1993). *Sociology in question*. London, UK: Sage.
- Calvo-Armengol, A., & Zenou, Y. (2005). Job matching, social network and word-of-mouth communication. *Journal of Urban Economics*, 57(3), 500-522.
- Coleman, J. (1988). Social capital in the creation of human capital. *American Journal of Sociology*, 94, S95-S120.
- Constable, N. (2005). *Cross-border marriages: Gender and mobility in transnational Asia*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Del Rosario, V. O. (1994). *Lifting the smokescreen: Dynamics of mail-order bride migration from the Philippines*. The Hague, Netherlands: Institute of Social Studies.
- Delander, L., Hammarstedt, M., Månsson, J., & Nyberg, E. (2005). Integration of immigrants: The role of language proficiency and experience. *Evaluation Review*, 29(1), 24-41.
- Dietz, J. (2010). Introduction to the special issue on employment discrimination against immigrants. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*,

25(2), 104-112.

- Glodava, M., & Onizuka, R. (1994). *Mail-order brides: Women for sale*. Fort Collins, CO: Alskan.
- Hsia, H. C. (2002). *The foreign bride phenomenon under the internationalization of capital*. Taipei, Taiwan: Tang-shan.
- Hsu, C. F., & Zho, F. H. (2007). Employment discrimination among mainland Chinese spouses in Chiayi. *Community Development Quarterly*, 119, 402-427.
- Lan, P. (2008). Migrant women's bodies as boundary markers: Reproductive crisis and sexual control in the new ethnic frontiers of Taiwan. *Signs. Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 33(4), 833-861.
- Lin, K. J., & Cheng, C. Y. (2013). *Willingness and strategies to hire foreign spouses among employers*. Taipei, Taiwan: National Immigration Agency.
- National Immigration Agency (2003). *Survey for living condition among foreign and Mainland Chinese spouses*. Taipei, Taiwan: Ministry of Interior. (In Chinese)
- National Immigration Agency (2008). *Survey for living condition among foreign and Mainland Chinese spouses*. Taipei, Taiwan: Ministry of Interior. (In Chinese)
- National Immigration Agency (2013). *Survey for living condition among foreign and Mainland Chinese spouses*. Taipei, Taiwan: Ministry of Interior. (In Chinese)
- Ordoñez, R. Z. (1997). Mail order brides: An emerging community. In M. P. P. Root (Ed.), *Filipino Americans: Transformation and identity* (121-142). Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Park, J. (2011). Job-related training of immigrants. *Perspectives on Labour and Income*, 23(3), 3-15.
- Piper, N. (1997). International marriage in Japan: Race and gender perspectives. *Gender, Place and Culture*, 4(3), 321-338.
- Piper, N., & Roces, M. (2003). Introduction: Marriage and migration in an age of globalization. In N. Piper & M. Roces (Eds.), *Wife or*

worker? *Asian women and migration* (pp. 1–22). Oxford, UK: Rowman & Littlefield.

- Piracha, M., Tani, M., & Vaira-Lucero, M. (2013). *Social capital and immigrants' labour market performance* (IZA Discussion Paper Series, No. 7274), Institute of Labor Economics. Retrieved from <https://econpapers.repec.org/paper/izaizadps/dp7274.htm>
- Ren, S., Zhang, J., & Hennessy, D. A. (2018). Psychological strains and psychological distress among Chinese rural migrant workers. *Asia and Pacific Migration Journal*, 27(2), 231–241.
- Seol, D. H., Kim, Y. T., Kim, H. M., Yoon, H. S., Lee, H. K., Yim, K. T., ... Han, G. (2005). *Foreign wives' life in Korea: Focusing on the policy of welfare and health*. Gwacheon, South Korea: Ministry of Health and Welfare. (In Korean)
- Suzuki, N. (2000). Between two shores: Transnational projects and Filipina wives in/from Japan. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 23(4), 431–444.
- Tashakkori, A., & Teddlie, C. (2003). *Handbook of mixed methods in social and behavioral research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Wang, H. Z. (2001). Social stratification, Vietnamese partners, migration and the Taiwan labor market. *Quarterly Social Studies*, 41(March), 99–127.
- Wang, H. Z. (2007). Hidden spaces of resistance of the subordinated: Case studies from Vietnamese female migrant partners in Taiwan. *The International Migration Review*, 41(3), 706–727.
- Wu, Y. L. (2015). Applying Culturally Responsive Pedagogy to the Vocational Training of Immigrants. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 4(2), 177–181.

## Biographical Note

**Hae Na Kim** has served as a Visiting Scholar of Educational Science at the University College of Teacher Education in Austria and as a Research Fellow at the National Central University in Taiwan. Her recent research focuses on career development, immigration policy, organizational culture, vocational education and training.  
E-mail: haenak97@gmail.com

**Yun-Hsiang Hsu** is an associate professor in the Institute of Law and Government at National Central University in Taiwan. He has also worked as a civil servant in several government agencies, including the Population Forecasting Unit at the National Development Council and the Ministry of Labor. Dr. Hsu's research interests focus on policy and program performance evaluation and various labor issues, including domestic employment. E-mail: yhhsu@cc.ncu.edu.tw

**Chih-Yu Cheng** is a Professor of Labor Studies at National Chengchi University in Taipei, Taiwan. His research focuses on Labor Relations, Labor Policy and Human Resource Policy. E-mail: cycheng@nccu.edu.tw

**Kuo-jung Lin**, Professor of International Trade Department, Chihlee University of Technology in Taiwan. His research focuses on labor economics, international economics, social and cultural adaptation of foreign immigrants and migrant workers  
E-mail: charlie@mail.chihlee.edu.tw

---

Date of submission of the article: October 29, 2019

Date of the peer-review: November 14, 2019

Date of the confirmation of the publication: June 4, 2020